



nyhart  
part of FuturePlan by Ascensus®

# City of Livonia Police and Fire Revised Retirement Plan

November 30, 2023  
GASB Nos. 67 & 68 Report

<b>Actuarial Certification</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>Summary</b>	<b>5</b>
<b>Statement of Fiduciary Net Position</b>	<b>6</b>
<b>Statement of Changes in Fiduciary Net Position</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>Schedule of Changes in Net Pension Liability and Related Ratios</b>	<b>8</b>
<b>Pension Expense</b>	<b>9</b>
<b>Deferred Outflows of Resources and Deferred Inflows of Resources Related to Pensions</b>	<b>10</b>
<b>Discount Rate and Net Pension Liability Sensitivity</b>	<b>12</b>
<b>Schedule of Contributions</b>	<b>13</b>
<b>Actuarial Assumptions for Total Pension Liability</b>	<b>14</b>
<b>Actuarial Assumptions for Actuarially Determined Contributions</b>	<b>15</b>
<b>Plan Provisions</b>	<b>17</b>

This report is prepared in accordance with our understanding of GASB Nos. 67 & 68 for the purpose of disclosing pension plans in financial statements. Determinations for purposes other than meeting these requirements may be significantly different from the results contained in this report.

The information presented in this report is based on:

- the actuarial assumptions included in this report;
- the plan provisions;
- participant information furnished to us by the Plan Administrator;
- asset information furnished to us by the Plan Trustee.

We have reviewed the provided data for reasonableness when compared to prior information provided, but have not audited the data. Where relevant data may be missing, we may have made assumptions we believe are reasonable for the purpose of the measurement. We are not aware of any significant issues with and have relied on the data provided. Any errors in the data provided may result in a different result than those provided in this report.

The interest rate, other economic assumptions, and demographic assumptions have been selected by the plan sponsor with our recommendations. The assumptions used, in our opinion, are reasonable and represent a reasonable expectation of future experience under the plan. All calculations have been made in accordance with generally accepted actuarial principles and practice.

A summary of any assumptions not included in this report, the plan provisions and the participant information is included in the Actuarial Valuation Report for funding purposes.

Future actuarial measurements may differ significantly from the current measurements presented in this report due to such factors as the following:

- plan experience differing from that anticipated by the economic or demographic assumptions;
- changes in economic or demographic assumptions;
- increases or decreases expected as part of the natural operation of the methodology used for these measurements (such as the end of an amortization period or additional cost or contribution requirements based on the plan's funded status ); and
- changes in plan provisions or applicable law.

We did not perform an analysis of the potential range of future measurements due to the limited scope of our engagement.

In preparing the results, Nyhart used Proval valuation software developed by Winklevoss Technologies, LLC. This software is widely used for the purpose of performing pension valuations. We coded the plan provisions, assumptions, methods, and participant data summarized in this report, and reviewed the liability and cost outputs for reasonableness. We are not aware of any material weaknesses or limitations in the software, and have determined it is appropriate for performing this valuation.

The undersigned are compliant with the continuing education requirements of the Qualification Standards for Actuaries Issuing Statements of Actuarial Opinion in the United States.

To our knowledge there have been no significant events prior to the current year's measurement date or as of the date of this report which could materially affect the results contained herein.

Neither Nyhart nor any of its employees have any relationships with the plan or plan sponsor which could impair or appear to impair the objectivity of this report.

Nyhart



---

Danielle Winegardner, FSA, EA, MAAA



---

Greg Faltenovich, EA, FCA, MAAA

---

03/11/2024

**Net Pension Liability**

The components of the net pension liability at November 30

	<b>11/30/2023</b>	<b>11/30/2022</b>
Total pension liability	\$ 9,102,686	\$ 4,817,234
Plan fiduciary net position	(8,211,238)	(4,292,540)
Net pension liability	\$ 891,448	\$ 524,694
Plan fiduciary net position as a percent of the total pension liability	90.21%	89.11%
Pension Expense for the Fiscal Year Ended November 30	\$ 2,359,473	\$ 1,856,065

**Actuarial Assumptions**

The total pension liability was determined using the following actuarial assumptions

Inflation	2.50%	2.50%
Salary increases, including inflation	6.00%	6.00%
Investment rate of return, including inflation, and net of investment expense	7.00%	7.00%

**Plan Membership**

The total pension liability was determined based on the plan membership as of November 30

	<b>2023</b>	<b>2022</b>
Inactive plan members and beneficiaries currently receiving benefits	1	0
Inactive plan members entitled to but not yet receiving benefits	20	11
Active plan members	163	159
Total members	184	170

**City of Livonia Police and Fire Revised Retirement Plan**  
**GASB Nos. 67 & 68 Report as of Fiscal Year Ending November 30, 2023**  
**Statement of Fiduciary Net Position**

<b>Assets</b>	<b>11/30/2023</b>	<b>11/30/2022</b>
Cash and deposits	\$ 0	\$ 0
Securities lending cash collateral	0	0
Total cash	\$ 0	\$ 0
Receivables:		
Contributions	\$ 277,970	\$ 224,661
Due from broker for investments sold	0	0
Investment income	8,455	2,801
Other	41,994	0
Total receivables	\$ 328,419	\$ 227,462
Investments:		
Short Term Investments	\$ 1,015,427	\$ 998,496
Fixed Income	1,858,683	203,254
Equities	5,015,643	2,866,970
Real Estate	0	0
Other	0	0
Total investments	\$ 7,889,753	\$ 4,068,720
Total assets	\$ 8,218,172	\$ 4,296,182
<b>Liabilities</b>		
Payables:		
Investment management fees	\$ 0	\$ 0
Due to broker for investments purchased	0	0
Collateral payable for securities lending	0	0
Other	6,934	3,642
Total liabilities	\$ 6,934	\$ 3,642
<b>Net position restricted for pensions</b>	<b>\$ 8,211,238</b>	<b>\$ 4,292,540</b>

**City of Livonia Police and Fire Revised Retirement Plan**  
**GASB Nos. 67 & 68 Report as of Fiscal Year Ending November 30, 2023**  
**Statement of Changes in Fiduciary Net Position**

	11/30/2023	11/30/2022
<b>Additions</b>		
Contributions:		
Employer	\$ 2,585,480	\$ 1,756,383
Member	1,019,243	935,795
Nonemployer contributing entity	0	0
Total contributions	\$ 3,604,723	\$ 2,692,178
Investment income:		
Net increase in fair value of investments	\$ 140,460	\$ (468,092)
Interest and dividends	296,814	151,663
Less investment expense, other than from securities lending	(16,367)	(13,021)
Net income other than from securities lending	\$ 420,907	\$ (329,450)
Securities lending income	0	0
Less securities lending expense	0	0
Net income from securities lending	\$ 0	\$ 0
Net investment income	\$ 420,907	\$ (329,450)
Other	0	0
Total additions	\$ 4,025,630	\$ 2,362,728
<b>Deductions</b>		
Benefit payments, including refunds of member contributions	\$ 53,933	\$ 8,790
Administrative expense	52,999	27,554
Other	0	0
Total deductions	\$ 106,932	\$ 36,344
<b>Net increase in net position</b>	\$ 3,918,698	\$ 2,326,384
<b>Net position restricted for pensions</b>		
Beginning of year	4,292,540	1,966,156
End of year	\$ 8,211,238	\$ 4,292,540

**City of Livonia Police and Fire Revised Retirement Plan**  
**GASB Nos. 67 & 68 Report as of Fiscal Year Ending November 30, 2023**  
**Schedule of Changes in Net Pension Liability and Related Ratios**

	<u>11/30/2023</u>	<u>11/30/2022</u>	<u>11/30/2021</u>
<b>Total pension liability</b>			
Service cost	\$ 3,011,099	\$ 2,565,865	\$ 0
Interest	546,096	298,171	0
Changes of benefit terms	0	0	1,698,117
Differences between expected and actual experience	782,190	263,871	0
Changes of assumptions	0	0	0
Benefit payments, including refunds of member contributions	(53,933)	(8,790)	0
Net change in total pension liability	<u>4,285,452</u>	<u>3,119,117</u>	<u>1,698,117</u>
Total pension liability - beginning	<u>4,817,234</u>	<u>1,698,117</u>	<u>0</u>
<b>Total pension liability - ending (a)</b>	<b>\$ 9,102,686</b>	<b>\$ 4,817,234</b>	<b>\$ 1,698,117</b>
<b>Plan fiduciary net position</b>			
Contributions - employer	\$ 2,585,480	\$ 1,756,383	\$ 1,037,029
Contributions - member	1,019,243	935,795	506,744
Contributions - nonemployer contributing member	0	0	429,683
Net investment income	420,907	(329,450)	0
Benefit payments, including refunds of member contributions	(53,933)	(8,790)	0
Administrative expenses	(52,999)	(27,554)	(7,300)
Other	0	0	0
Net change in plan fiduciary net position	<u>\$ 3,918,698</u>	<u>\$ 2,326,384</u>	<u>\$ 1,966,156</u>
Plan fiduciary net position - beginning	<u>4,292,540</u>	<u>1,966,156</u>	<u>0</u>
<b>Plan fiduciary net position - ending (b)</b>	<b>\$ 8,211,238</b>	<b>\$ 4,292,540</b>	<b>\$ 1,966,156</b>
<b>Net pension liability - ending (a) - (b)</b>	<b>\$ 891,448</b>	<b>\$ 524,694</b>	<b>\$ (268,039)</b>
Plan fiduciary net position as a percentage of the total pension liability	90.21%	89.11%	115.78%
Covered-employee payroll	\$ 12,988,303	\$ 12,593,492	\$ 6,715,276
Net pension liability as percentage of covered - employee payroll	6.86%	4.17%	-3.99%

**City of Livonia Police and Fire Revised Retirement Plan**  
**GASB Nos. 67 & 68 Report as of Fiscal Year Ending November 30, 2023**  
**Pension Expense**

Fiscal year ending	<u>11/30/2023</u>	<u>11/30/2022</u>
Service cost	\$ 3,011,099	\$ 2,565,865
Interest on total pension liability	546,096	298,171
Projected earnings on pension plan investments	(422,900)	(230,585)
Changes of benefit terms	0	0
Employee contributions	(1,019,243)	(935,795)
Pension plan administrative expense	52,999	27,554
Other changes	0	0
Current period recognition of deferred outflows/(inflows) of resources		
Differences between Expected & Actual Experience in measurement of the Total Pension Liability	\$ 79,016	\$ 18,848
Changes of assumptions	0	0
Differences between Projected & Actual Earnings on Pension Plan Investments	112,406	112,007
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$ 2,359,473</b>	<b>\$ 1,856,065</b>

**City of Livonia Police and Fire Revised Retirement Plan**  
**GASB Nos. 67 & 68 Report as of Fiscal Year Ending November 30, 2023**  
**Deferred Outflows of Resources and Deferred Inflows of Resources Related to Pensions**

Differences between expected and actual experience in measurement of the total pension liability for fiscal year ending:	Initial Balance	Amortization Period	Annual Recognition	11/30/2023 Balance
November 30, 2023	\$ 782,190	13.0	\$ 60,168	\$ 722,022
November 30, 2022	\$ 263,871	14.0	\$ 18,848	\$ 226,175
			\$ 79,016	\$ 948,197

  

Changes in assumptions for fiscal year ending:	Initial Balance	Amortization Period	Annual Recognition	11/30/2023 Balance
November 30, 2023	\$ 0	13.0	\$ 0	\$ 0
			\$ 0	\$ 0

  

Differences between projected and actual earnings on pension plan investments for fiscal year ending:	Initial Balance	Amortization Period	Annual Recognition	11/30/2023 Balance
November 30, 2023	\$ 1,993	5.0	\$ 399	\$ 1,594
November 30, 2022	\$ 560,035	5.0	\$ 112,007	\$ 336,021
			\$ 112,406	\$ 337,615

**City of Livonia Police and Fire Revised Retirement Plan  
 GASB Nos. 67 & 68 Report as of Fiscal Year Ending November 30, 2023  
 Deferred Outflows of Resources and Deferred Inflows of Resources Related to Pensions**

	Deferred Outflows of Resources	Deferred Inflows of Resources
Differences between expected and actual experience	\$ 948,197	\$ 0
Changes of Assumptions	\$ 0	\$ 0
Net difference between projected and actual earnings on pension plan investments	\$ 337,615	\$ 0
	\$ 1,285,812	\$ 0

The balances as of November 30, 2023 of the deferred outflows/(inflows) of resources will be recognized in pension expense for the fiscal year ending November 30.

11/30/2024	\$ 191,422
11/30/2025	\$ 191,422
11/30/2026	\$ 191,422
11/30/2027	\$ 79,413
11/30/2028	\$ 79,016
Thereafter	\$ 553,117

**Discount rate**

The discount rate used to measure the total pension liability was 7.00%. The projection of cash flows used to determine the discount rate assumed that plan member contributions will be made at the current contribution rate and that contributions will be made at rates equal to the difference between actuarially determined contribution rates and the member rate. Professional judgment on future contributions has been applied in those cases where contribution patterns deviate from the actuarially determined rates. Based on those assumptions, the pension plan's fiduciary net position was projected to be available to make all projected future benefit payments of current plan members. Therefore, the long-term expected rate of return on pension plan investments was applied to all periods of projected benefit payments to determine the total pension liability.

**Sensitivity of the net pension liability to changes in the discount rate**

The following presents the net pension liability, calculated using the discount rate of 7.00%, as well as what the net pension liability would be if it were calculated using a discount rate that is 1-percentage-point lower (6.00%) or 1-percentage-point higher (8.00%) than the current rate:

	<b>1% Decrease (6.00%)</b>	<b>Current Discount Rate (7.00%)</b>	<b>1% Increase (8.00%)</b>
Net pension liability	\$ 2,560,236	\$ 891,448	\$ (446,645)

**City of Livonia Police and Fire Revised Retirement Plan**  
**GASB Nos. 67 & 68 Report as of Fiscal Year Ending November 30, 2023**  
**Schedule of Contributions**

	<u>2023</u>	<u>2022</u>	<u>2021</u>	<u>2020</u>	<u>2019</u>
Actuarially determined contribution	\$ 2,585,480	\$ 1,756,383	\$ 1,037,029	\$ 0	\$ 0
Contributions in relation to the actuarially determined contribution	2,585,480	1,756,383	1,037,029	0	0
<b>Contribution deficiency (excess)</b>	<b>\$ 0</b>				
Covered-employee payroll	\$ 12,988,303	\$ 12,593,492	\$ 6,715,276	Not Applicable	Not Applicable
Contributions as a percentage of covered -employee payroll	19.91%	13.95%	15.44%	Not Applicable	Not Applicable
	<u>2018</u>	<u>2017</u>	<u>2016</u>	<u>2015</u>	<u>2014</u>
Actuarially determined contribution	\$ 0	\$ 0	\$ 0	\$ 0	\$ 0
Contributions in relation to the actuarially determined contribution	0	0	0	0	0
<b>Contribution deficiency (excess)</b>	<b>\$ 0</b>				
Covered-employee payroll	Not Applicable				
Contributions as a percentage of covered -employee payroll	Not Applicable				

The total pension liability as of November 30, 2023 was determined using the following actuarial assumptions:

<b>Measurement Date</b>	November 30, 2023
<b>Actuarial Cost Method</b>	Entry Age Normal
<b>Asset Method</b>	Market Value of Assets
<b>Interest Rates</b>	
<b>Discount Rate</b>	7.00%
<b>Expected Long Term Rate of Return</b>	7.00%
<b>Municipal Bond Rate</b>	N/A
<b>Inflation</b>	2.50%
<b>Annual Pay Increases</b>	6.00%
<b>Mortality Rates</b>	
<b>Active Lives</b>	PubS-2010 Employee mortality projected using fully generational improvements based on the Society of Actuaries' MP-2021 Projection Scale
<b>Inactive Lives</b>	PubS-2010 Healthy Retiree mortality projected using fully generational improvements based on the Society of Actuaries' MP-2021 Projection Scale
<b>All other assumptions</b>	As described in the assumptions section of the actuarial determined contribution

<b>Valuation Date</b>	November 30, 2023
<b>Participant and Asset Information Collected as of</b>	November 30, 2023
<b>Actuarial Cost Method</b>	Entry Age Normal
<b>Amortization Method</b>	Closed level percentage of payroll amortization of the Unfunded Actuarial Accrued Liability using a 2.50% payroll growth assumption over the period ending on November 30, 2039 (17-year amortization in 2022)
<b>Asset Method</b>	5 year smoothing of asset gains and losses
<b>Interest Rates</b>	7.00%, net of investment expenses
<b>Inflation</b>	2.50%
<b>Annual Pay Increases</b>	6.00%
<b>Mortality Rates</b>	
<b>Active Lives</b>	PubS-2010 Employee mortality projected using fully generational improvements based on the Society of Actuaries' MP-2021 Projection Scale
<b>Inactive Lives</b>	PubS-2010 Healthy Retiree mortality projected using fully generational improvements based on the Society of Actuaries' MP-2021 Projection Scale
<b>Martical Status and Ages</b>	90% of Participants assumed to be married with wives assumed to be 3 years younger than husbands.

**Retirement Rates (Police)**

Service	Age		
	<52	52-59	60+
<25	0%	10%	100%
25	75%	75%	100%
26-29	25%	25%	100%
30	100%	100%	100%

**Retirement Rates (Fire)**

Service	Age				
	<52	52	53	54-59	60+
<25	0%	35%	20%	10%	100%
25-29	40%	40%	40%	40%	100%
30	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%

**Termination Rates**

Recommended rates from 2021 experience study:

Age	Rates
20	1.62%
25	1.62%
30	1.40%
35	0.83%
40	0.32%
45	0.18%
50	0.18%
55	0.18%
60	0.18%
66+	0.00%

**Disability Rates**

Age	Rates
20	0.035%
25	0.060%
30	0.120%
35	0.200%
40	0.275%
45	0.355%
50	0.435%
55	0.515%
60	0.515%

**Plan Administration:**

The Plan is a single employer defined benefit pension plan administered by a Board of Trustees comprised of:

- a.) The mayor or mayor's designated administrative representative,
- b.) A member of the City Council, selected by the Council,
- c.) A member of the Civil Service Commission,
- d.) A police or fire member, elected by police and fire members,
- e.) A member of any retirement plan established by city ordinance who is not a police or fire member.

**Effective Date:**

The plan is effective as follows for newly employed and otherwise eligible individuals:

Non-Union Police Command:	July 12, 2021
Non-Union Fire Command:	January 23, 2021
Police Officers:	February 27, 2021
Police Lieutenants, Sergeants and Command:	April 10, 2021
Fire Members:	January 30, 2021

**Average Final Compensation:**

The average of the highest annual compensations received during any 3 years of service contained within the 10 years of service immediately preceding retirement. Compensation includes base salary or wages, Worker's Compensation wage loss benefits (supplemental pay not to exceed regular base wages), and any other financial compensation from which pension contributions are withheld.

**Service:**

Member's service earned in the Police and Fire Revised Retirement Plan. Service is used for benefit calculation purposes.

**Total Service:**

The sum of service earned in the Police and Fire Revised Retirement Plan and applicable prior service. Total Service is used for vesting service.

**Voluntary Retirement Eligibility:**

25 years of service regardless of age, or age 52 with 15 years of service.

**Normal Pension Amount:**

2.5% of the member's average final compensation (AFC) times years of credited service; maximum is 75% of AFC at 30 years.

**Deferred Pension (Vesting):**

**Eligibility:** Termination of City employment, other than by death or disability, prior to attaining voluntary retirement age but after completing at least 15 full years of credited service.

**Amount:** A monthly pension, payable beginning at voluntary retirement age (or early retirement age with a reduced benefit), computed in the same manner as a normal pension but based on credited service and AFC at time of termination of City employment

**Disability Retirement:**

**Eligibility:** Termination of City employment by reason of total and permanent disability after completing at least 10 full years of credited service, except that in the event of a duty disability the 10-year service requirement is waived.

**Amount:** 1) Disability incurred after age 55: A monthly pension computed in the same manner as a normal pension but based on credited service and AFC at the time of termination. (2) Disability incurred before age 55: A monthly pension computed in the same manner as a normal pension but based on AFC at time of termination and the credited service the member would have completed had employment continued until age 55, provided that in the event of a duty disability the pension payable to age 55 shall not be less than 75% of AFC. Worker's compensation benefits are deducted. For non-duty disability cases, the following limitations apply:

<u>Maximum Total Actual Years Of Service</u>	<u>Maximum Benefit Years Used to Compute Benefit</u>	<u>As a Percent of AFC</u>
10-15	20	50.0%
16-20	25	62.5
Over 20	30- or actual service if greater	75.0

**Non-Duty Death:**

Eligibility: Death after completing 10 years of credited service, but before termination of City employment. If member had not attained age 55 at the time of death, the death benefit shall commence at the time they would have attained voluntary retirement age. Member must either: ( 1) have elected Option A and named a beneficiary, or (2) leave a surviving spouse in the event Option A was not elected.

Amount: Monthly pension the beneficiary would have received had the member retired the day before death (notwithstanding that he might not have attained his voluntary retirement age) and elected the 100% joint and survivor Option A.

**Duty Death:**

Eligibility: Death from causes arising solely and exclusively out of and in the course of a member's City employment.

Amount: Surviving spouse, or unmarried children under age 18 (if no surviving spouse), or dependent parents (if no surviving spouse or children) shall receive a monthly pension equal to the pension payable if the member had become duty disabled, elected the 100% survivor option and subsequently died. The option factor for children or parents is assumed to equal 80%. The benefit shall continue until: ( a) death in the case of the widow, (b) death, marriage, adoption or attainment of age 18 in the case of the children. Worker's compensation benefits are deducted.

**Employee Contributions:**

Members contribute 4.00% of base wages, plus additional amounts dependent upon the actuarially determined contribution "ADC":

ADC greater than 8.00%:

- City contributes next 10% of base wages towards ADC (between 8% and 18%)
- Employees contribute next 4% of base wages toward the ADC (between 18% and 22%)
- City contributes the required ADC above 22% of base wages